# SCALING AND GENERALIZING APPROXIMATE BAYESIAN INFERENCE

David M. Blei Columbia University This talk is about how to discover hidden patterns in large high-dimensional data sets.



## Communities discovered in a 3.7M node network of U.S. Patents

[Gopalan and Blei, PNAS 2013]

0	0	8	9	6
Game	Life	Film	Book	Wine
Season	Know	Movie	Life	Street
Team	School	Show	Books	Hotel
Coach	Street	Life	Novel	House
Play	Man	Television	Story	Room
Points	Family	Films	Man	Night
Games	Says	Director	Author	Place
Giants	House	Man	House	Restaurant
Second	Children	Story	War	Park
Players	Night	Says	Children	Garden
6	0	8	9	0
Bush	Building	Won	Yankees	Government
Campaign	Street	Team	Game	War
Clinton	Square	Second	Mets	Military
Republican	Housing	Race	Season	Officials
House	House	Round	Run	Iraq
Party	Buildings	Cup	League	Forces
Democratic	Development	Open	Baseball	Iraqi
Political	Space	Game	Team	Army
Democrats	Percent	Play	Games	Troops
Senator	Real	Win	Hit	Soldiers
0	Ð	ß	•	ß
Children	Stock	Church	Art	Police
School	Percent	War	Museum	Yesterday
Women	Companies	Women	Show	Man
Family	Fund	Life	Gallery	Officer
Parents	Market	Black	Works	Officers
Child	Bank	Political	Artists	Case
Life	Investors	Catholic	Street	Found
Says	Funds	Government	Artist	Charged
Help	Financial	Jewish	Paintings	Street
Mother	Business	Pope	Exhibition	Shot

# Topics found in 1.8M articles from the New York Times

[Hoffman, Blei, Wang, Paisley, JMLR 2013]



Population analysis of 2 billion genetic measurements

[Gopalan, Hao, Blei, Storey, to appear]



# Neuroscience analysis of 220 million fMRI measurements

[Manning et al., PLOS ONE 2014]



Analysis of 1.7M taxi trajectories, in Stan

[Kucukelbir et al., 2016]



- Customized data analysis is important to many fields.
- Pipeline separates assumptions, computation, application
- Eases collaborative solutions to statistics problems



- ▶ Inference is the key algorithmic problem.
- Answers the question: What does this model say about this data?
- Our goal: General and scalable approaches to inference



- Variational methods: inference as optimization [Jordan et al., 1999]
- Scale up with stochastic variational inference (SVI) [Hoffman et al., 2013]
- Generalize with black box variational inference (BBVI) [Ranganath et al., 2014]



- Both approaches use stochastic optimization.
- SVI subsamples from a massive data set
- BBVI uses Monte Carlo to approximate difficult-to-compute expectations

# STOCHASTIC VARIATIONAL INFERENCE

(with Matt Hoffman, Chong Wang, John Paisley)

Stochastic variational inference is an algorithm that scales general Bayesian computation to massive data.



# **Motivation: Topic Modeling**

- 1. Discover the thematic structure in a large collection of documents
- 2. Annotate the documents
- 3. Use the annotations to visualize, organize, summarize, ...

# Seeking Life's Bare (Genetic) Necessities

Haemophilu

oenome

COLD SPRING HARBOR, NEW YORK— How many genes does an organism need to survive! Last week at the genome meeting here,<sup>8</sup> two genome researchers with radically different approaches presented complementary views of the basic genes needed for lifte One research team, using computer analyses to compare known genomes, concluded that today's organisms can be sustained with but 250 genes, and that the earliest life forms

required a mere 128 tenes. The other researcher mapped genes in a simple parasite and estimated that for this organism, 800 genes are plenty to do the job—but that anything short of 100 wouldn't be enough.

Although the numbers don't match precisely, those predictions

\* Genome Mapping and Sequencing, Cold Spring Harbor, New York, May 8 to 12.

SCIENCE • VOL. 272 • 24 MAY 1996

Documents exhibit multiple topics.

"are not all that far apart," especially in comparison to the 75,000 genes in the human genome, notes Siv Andersson of Uppsala University in Sweden, who arrived at the 800 number. But coming up with a consensus answer may be more than just a genetic number; game, particularly as more and more genomes are completely mapped and sequenced. "It may be a way of organizing any newly sequenced genome," explains Arcady Mushegian, a computational molecular biologist at the National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) in Bethesda, Maryland. Comparing an



Stripping down. Computer analysis yields an estimate of the minimum modern and ancient genomes.

# Example: Latent Dirichlet allocation (LDA)



- Each topic is a distribution over words
- Each document is a mixture of corpus-wide topics
- Each word is drawn from one of those topics

# Example: Latent Dirichlet allocation (LDA)



- But we only observe the documents; the other structure is hidden.
- We compute the posterior

p(topics, proportions, assignments | documents)

# Example: Latent Dirichlet allocation (LDA)



- Many data sets contain millions of documents.
- This requires inference about billions of variables.
- SVI can scale to these data.

# LDA as a graphical model



- Encodes assumptions about data with a factorization of the joint
- Connects assumptions to algorithms for computing with data
- Defines the posterior (through the joint)

#### Posterior inference



The posterior of the latent variables given the documents is

$$p(\beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{z} \,|\, \mathbf{w}) = \frac{p(\beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{z}, \mathbf{w})}{\int_{\beta} \int_{\boldsymbol{\theta}} \sum_{\mathbf{z}} p(\beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{z}, \mathbf{w})}$$

- We can't compute the denominator, the marginal  $p(\mathbf{w})$ .
- ▶ We use approximate inference.

#### Classical variational inference



- Originally, we used variational methods to fit this model. [Blei et al., 2003]
- Classical variational inference is inefficient:
  - Do some local computation for each data point.
  - Aggregate these computations to re-estimate global structure.
  - Repeat.
- This cannot handle massive data.

#### Stochastic variational inference



#### Stochastic variational inference



[Hoffman et al., 2010]

0	0	8	0	5
Game	Life	Film	Book	Wine
Season	Know	Movie	Life	Street
Toom	School	Chow	Rookr	Hotel
Coach	Street	Life	Novel	House
Play	Man	Television	Story	Room
Rointr	Eamily	Filme	Man	Night
Gamor	Save	Director	Author	Place
Ciantes	Jays	Man	Hausa	Destaurant
Canad	Children	Man .	Maa	Deel
Second	Children	Story	VVdr	FdIK
Players	Night	Says	Children	Garden
6	0	8	0	10
Bush	Building	Won	Yankees	Government
Campaign	Street	Team	Game	War
Clinton	Square	Second	Mets	Military
Republican	Housing	Race	Season	Officials
House	House	Round	Run	Iraq
Party	Buildings	Cup	League	Forces
Democratic	Development	Open	Baseball	Iragi
Political	Space	Game	Team	Army
Democrats	Percent	Play	Games	Troops
Senator	Real	Win	Hit	Soldiers
0	D	B	1	G
Children	Stock	Church	Art	Police
School	Percent	War	Museum	Yesterday
Women	Companies	Women	Show	Man
Family	Fund	Life	Gallery	Officer
Parents	Market	Black	Works	Officers
Child	Bank	Political	Artists	Case
Life	Investors	Catholic	Street	Found
Says	Funds	Government	Artist	Charged
Help	Financial	Jewish	Paintings	Street
Mother	Business	Pope	Exhibition	Shot

Topics using the HDP, found in 1.8M articles from the New York Times

#### Stochastic variational inference



Next parts of this talk:

- 1. Define a generic class of models
- 2. Derive classical mean-field variational inference
- 3. Use the classical algorithm to derive stochastic variational inference



- The observations are  $\mathbf{x} = x_{1:n}$ .
- The **local** variables are  $\mathbf{z} = z_{1:n}$ .
- The **global** variables are  $\beta$ .
- The *i* th data point  $x_i$  only depends on  $z_i$  and  $\beta$ .

Goal: Compute  $p(\beta, \mathbf{z} | \mathbf{x})$ .



- A complete conditional is the conditional of a latent variable given the observations and other latent variables.
- Assume each complete conditional is in the exponential family,

$$p(z_i | \beta, x_i) = h(z_i) \exp\{\eta_\ell(\beta, x_i)^\top z_i - a(\eta_\ell(\beta, x_i))\}\$$
$$p(\beta | \mathbf{z}, \mathbf{x}) = h(\beta) \exp\{\eta_g(\mathbf{z}, \mathbf{x})^\top \beta - a(\eta_g(\mathbf{z}, \mathbf{x}))\}.$$



- A complete conditional is the conditional of a latent variable given the observations and other latent variable.
- The global parameter comes from conjugacy [Bernardo and Smith, 1994]

$$\eta_g(\mathbf{z}, \mathbf{x}) = \alpha + \sum_{i=1}^n t(z_i, x_i),$$

where  $\alpha$  is a hyperparameter and  $t(\cdot)$  are sufficient statistics for  $[z_i, x_i]$ .



- Dirichlet process mixture with conjugate base measure [Sethuraman, 1994]
  - Local: mixture assignments for each observation (categorical).
  - Global: stick lengths (beta) and mixture components (e.g., Gaussian).
- Other BNP models, e.g.,
  - Beta-Bernoulli process
  - Hierarchical Dirichlet process



- Bayesian mixture models
- Time series models (variants of HMMs, Kalman filters)
- Factorial models
- Matrix factorization (e.g., factor analysis, PCA, CCA)

- Dirichlet process mixtures, HDPs
- Multilevel regression (linear, probit, Poisson)
- Stochastic blockmodels
- Mixed-membership models (LDA and some variants)





- Variational methods turn inference into optimization
- Idea: Fit a simple distribution to be close (in KL) to the exact posterior
- Here: A simple mixture of Gaussians [image by Alp Kucukelbir]

#### Mean-field variational inference



- ▶ Goal: Minimize KL divergence between a family *q* and the posterior *p*.
- Mean-field assumption: Set  $q(\beta, \mathbf{z})$  to be fully factored,

$$q(\beta, \mathbf{z}) = q(\beta \mid \lambda) \prod_{i=1}^{n} q(z_i \mid \phi_i).$$

Each factor is the same family as the model's complete conditional,

$$p(\beta \mid \mathbf{z}, \mathbf{x}) = h(\beta) \exp\{\eta_g(\mathbf{z}, \mathbf{x})^\top \beta - a(\eta_g(\mathbf{z}, \mathbf{x}))\}\$$
$$q(\beta \mid \lambda) = h(\beta) \exp\{\lambda^\top \beta - a(\lambda)\}.$$

#### Mean-field variational inference



Optimize the evidence lower bound, equivalent to optimizing negative KL,

$$\mathcal{L}(\lambda, \phi_{1:n}) = \mathbb{E}_q[\log p(\beta, \mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{x})] - \mathbb{E}_q[\log q(\beta, \mathbf{Z})].$$

Traditional VI uses coordinate ascent [Ghahramani and Beal, 2001]

$$\lambda^* = \mathbb{E}_{\phi} \left[ \eta_g(\mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{x}) \right]; \, \phi_i^* = \mathbb{E}_{\lambda} \left[ \eta_\ell(\beta, x_i) \right]$$

Iteratively update each parameter, holding others fixed.
 Notice the relationship to Gibbs sampling.

#### Mean-field variational inference for LDA



- The local variables are the per-document variables  $\theta_d$  and  $\mathbf{z}_d$ .
- The global variables are the topics  $\beta_1, \ldots, \beta_K$ .
- The variational distribution is

$$q(\beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{z}) = \prod_{k=1}^{K} q(\beta_k \mid \lambda_k) \prod_{d=1}^{D} q(\theta_d \mid \gamma_d) \prod_{n=1}^{N} q(z_{d,n} \mid \phi_{d,n})$$

#### Mean-field variational inference for LDA

#### Seeking Life's Bare (Genetic) Necessities

genome

COLD SPRING HARBOR, NEW YORK— How many genes does an organism need to survive! Last week at the genome meeting here," two genome researchers with radically different approaches presented complementary views of the basic genes needed for life. One research team, using computer analyses to compute known genomes, concluded that today's organisms can be sustained with pice 255 genes. and that the critical life forms

required a mere 128 genes. The other researcher mapped genes in a simple parasite and estimated that for this organism, 800 genes are plenty to do the job—but that anything short of 100 wouldn't be enough.

Although the numbers don't match precisely, those predictions

\* Genome Mapping and Sequencing, Cold Spring Harbor, New York, May 8 to 12. "are not all that far apart," especially in comparison to the 75,000 genes in the human genome, notes Siv Andersson of Uppsale University in Sweden, who arrived at the 800 numbers. But coming up with a consensus answer may be more than just a genetic numbers game, particularly as more and more genomes are completely mapped and sequenced." It may be a way of organiting any newly sequenced genome," explains Aready Mushegian, a computational mo-

lecular biologist at the National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) in Bethesda, Maryland. Comparing an





SCIENCE • VOL. 272 • 24 MAY 1996



#### Mean-field variational inference for LDA

human genome dna genetic genes sequence gene molecular sequencing map information genetics mapping project sequences

evolution evolutionary species organisms life origin biology groups phylogenetic living diversity group new two common

disease host bacteria diseases resistance bacterial new strains control infectious malaria parasite parasites united tuberculosis

computer models information data computers system network systems model parallel methods networks software new simulations

```
Input: data x, model p(\beta, \mathbf{z}, \mathbf{x}).
Initialize \lambda randomly.
repeat
      for each data point i do
            Set local parameter \phi_i \leftarrow \mathbb{E}_{\lambda} [\eta_{\ell}(\beta, x_i)].
      end
      Set global parameter
                                    \lambda \leftarrow \alpha + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mathbb{E}_{\phi_i} [t(Z_i, x_i)]
until the ELBO has converged
```

*This is inefficient*: We analyze all data before completing one iteration.

#### Stochastic optimization

#### A STOCHASTIC APPROXIMATION METHOD<sup>1</sup>

BY HERBERT ROBBINS AND SUTTON MONRO

University of North Carolina

**1.** Summary. Let M(x) denote the expected value at level x of the response to a certain experiment. M(x) is assumed to be a monotone function of x but is unknown to the experimenter, and it is desired to find the solution  $x = \theta$  of the equation  $M(x) = \alpha$ , where  $\alpha$  is a given constant. We give a method for making successive experiments at levels  $x_1, x_2, \cdots$  in such a way that  $x_n$  will tend to  $\theta$  in probability.



- Replace the gradient with cheaper noisy estimates [Robbins and Monro, 1951]
- Guaranteed to converge to a local optimum [Bottou, 1996]
- Has enabled modern machine learning

#### Natural gradients

#### Natural Gradient Works Efficiently in Learning

Shun-ichi Amari RIKEN Frontier Research Program, Saitama 351-01, Japan

When a parameter space has a certain underlying structure, the ordinary gradient of a function does not represent its steepest direction, but the natural gradient does. Information geometry is used for calculating the natural gradients in the parameter space of perceptrons, the space of matrices (for blind source separation), and the space of linear dynamical systems (for blind source deconvolution). The dynamical behavior of natural gradient online learning is analyzed and is proved to be Fisher efficient, implying that it has asymptotically the same performance as the optimal batch estimation of parameters. This suggests that the plateau phenomenon, which appears in the backpropagation learning algorithm of multilayer perceptrons, might disappear or might not be so serious when the natural gradient is used. An adaptive method of updating the learning rate is proposed and analyzed.



The natural gradient of the ELBO [Amari, 1998; Sato, 2001]

$$\hat{\nabla}_{\lambda} \mathcal{L} = \left( \alpha + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mathbb{E}_{\phi_i} [t(Z_i, x_i)] \right) - \lambda.$$

#### Computationally:

- Compute coordinate updates.
- Subtract the current variational parameters.

#### Stochastic variational inference



- Construct a noisy natural gradient
  - Sample a data point at random  $j \sim \text{Uniform}(1, \ldots, n)$ .
  - Calculate

$$\tilde{\nabla}_{\lambda} \mathcal{L} = \alpha + n \mathbb{E}_{\phi_j^*}[t(Z_j, x_j)] - \lambda$$

- This is a good noisy gradient
  - The expectation (with respect to j) is the natural gradient.
  - Only requires the local parameters for one data point.

```
Input: data x, model p(\beta, \mathbf{z}, \mathbf{x}).
Initialize \lambda randomly. Set \rho_t appropriately.
repeat
       Sample j \sim \text{Unif}(1, \ldots, n).
       Set local parameter \phi \leftarrow \mathbb{E}_{\lambda} [\eta_{\ell}(\beta, x_i)].
       Set intermediate global parameter
                                              \hat{\lambda} = \alpha + n \mathbb{E}_{\boldsymbol{\phi}}[t(\boldsymbol{Z}_i, \boldsymbol{x}_i)].
       Set global parameter
                                                 \lambda = (1 - \rho_t)\lambda + \rho_t \hat{\lambda}.
```

until forever

#### Stochastic variational inference



#### Stochastic variational inference in LDA



- 1. Sample a document
- 2. Estimate the local variational parameters using the current topics
- 3. Form intermediate topics from those local parameters
- 4. Update topics as a weighted average of intermediate and current topics

#### Stochastic variational inference in LDA



[Hoffman et al., 2010]

# HDP topic models



- ► A study of large corpora with the HDP topic model [Teh et al., 2006]
- Details are in Hoffman et al., 2013.
- SVI is faster and lets us analyze more data.

0	0	8	0	5
Game	Life	Film	Book	Wine
Season	Know	Movie	Life	Street
Toom	School	Chow	Rookr	Hotel
Coach	Street	Life	Novel	House
Play	Man	Television	Story	Room
Rointr	Eamily	Filme	Man	Night
Gamor	Save	Director	Author	Place
Ciantes	Jays	Man	Hausa	Destaurant
Canad	Children	Man .	Maa	Deel
Second	Children	Story	VVdr	FdIK
Players	Night	Says	Children	Garden
6	0	8	0	10
Bush	Building	Won	Yankees	Government
Campaign	Street	Team	Game	War
Clinton	Square	Second	Mets	Military
Republican	Housing	Race	Season	Officials
House	House	Round	Run	Iraq
Party	Buildings	Cup	League	Forces
Democratic	Development	Open	Baseball	Iragi
Political	Space	Game	Team	Army
Democrats	Percent	Play	Games	Troops
Senator	Real	Win	Hit	Soldiers
0	D	B	1	G
Children	Stock	Church	Art	Police
School	Percent	War	Museum	Yesterday
Women	Companies	Women	Show	Man
Family	Fund	Life	Gallery	Officer
Parents	Market	Black	Works	Officers
Child	Bank	Political	Artists	Case
Life	Investors	Catholic	Street	Found
Says	Funds	Government	Artist	Charged
Help	Financial	Jewish	Paintings	Street
Mother	Business	Pope	Exhibition	Shot

Topics using the HDP, found in 1.8M articles from the New York Times

## Stochastic variational inference



We derived an algorithm for scalable variational inference.

- Bayesian mixture models
- Time series models (variants of HMMs, Kalman filters)
- Factorial models
- Matrix factorization (e.g., factor analysis, PCA, CCA)

- Dirichlet process mixtures, HDPs
- Multilevel regression (linear, probit, Poisson)
- Stochastic blockmodels
- Mixed-membership models (LDA and some variants)



# **BLACK BOX VARIATIONAL INFERENCE**

(with Rajesh Ranganath and Sean Gerrish)

Black box variational inference is an algorithm that efficiently performs Bayesian computation in any model.



- Approximate inference can be difficult to derive.
- Especially true for models that are not conditionally conjugate
- E.g., discrete choice models, Bayesian generalized linear models, ...



- Easily use variational inference with any model
- No exponential family requirements
- No mathematical work beyond specifying the model



- Sample from  $q(\cdot)$
- Form noisy gradients without model-specific computation
- Use stochastic optimization



ELBO:

$$\mathcal{L}(v) = \mathbb{E}_q[\log p(\beta, \mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{x}) - \log q_v(\beta, \mathbf{Z})]$$

Shorthand:

$$\mathcal{L}(\nu) = \mathbb{E}_q[D_{\nu}(\beta, \mathbf{Z})]$$



A noisy gradient:

$$\nabla_{\nu} \mathcal{L} \approx \frac{1}{B} \sum_{b=1}^{B} \nabla_{\nu} \log q_{\nu} \left(\beta_{b}, \mathbf{z}_{b}\right) D_{\nu}(\beta, \mathbf{Z})$$

where

$$(\beta_b, \mathbf{z}_b) \sim q_{\nu}(\beta, \mathbf{z})$$

# The noisy gradient

$$\nabla_{\nu} \mathcal{L}(\nu) \approx \frac{1}{B} \sum_{b=1}^{B} \nabla_{\nu} \log q_{\nu}(\beta_{b}, z_{b}) D_{\nu}(\beta_{b}, z_{b})$$

- We use these gradients in a stochastic optimization algorithm.
- Requirements:
  - Sampling from  $q_{\nu}(\beta, \mathbf{z})$
  - Evaluating  $abla_{
    u} \log q_{
    u}(eta, \mathbf{z})$
  - Evaluating  $\log p(eta,\mathbf{z},\mathbf{x})$
- A "black box": We can reuse  $q(\cdot)$  across models

# The noisy gradient

$$\nabla_{\nu} \mathcal{L}(\nu) \approx \frac{1}{B} \sum_{b=1}^{B} \nabla_{\nu} \log q_{\nu}(\beta_{b}, z_{b}) D_{\nu}(\beta_{b}, z_{b})$$

Making it work:

- Rao-Blackwellization for each component of the gradient
- Control variates, again using  $\nabla_{\nu} \log q_{\nu}(\beta, z)$
- AdaGrad, for setting learning rates [Duchi, Hazan, Singer, 2011]
- Stochastic variational inference, for handling massive data

## Monte Carlo Gradients of the ELBO



- MC gradient [Ji et al., 2010; Nott et al., 2012; Paisley et al., 2012; Ranganath et al. 2014]
- Autoencoders [Kingma and Welling, 2013/2014]
- ▶ Neural networks [Kingma et al., 2015; Mnih and Gregor, 2014; Rezende et al., 2014]
- A perspective from regression [Salimans and Knowles, 2014]
- Doubly stochastic VB [Titsias and Lazaro-Gredilla, 2014]



# Neuroscience analysis of 220 million fMRI measurements

[Manning et al., PLOS ONE 2014]



Deep Exponential Families [Ranganath et al., AISTATS 2015]



# Probabilistic Programming

[Kucukelbir et al., 2015]



Edward: A library for probabilistic modeling, inference, and criticism

github.com/blei-lab/edward

(lead by Dustin Tran)



- Customized data analysis is important to many fields.
- Pipeline separates assumptions, computation, application
- Eases collaborative solutions to statistics problems



- ▶ Inference is the key algorithmic problem.
- Answers the question: What does this model say about this data?
- Our goal: General and scalable approaches to inference



"Stochastic variational inference" [Hoffman et al., 2013, JMLR]



"Black box variational inference" [Ranganath et al., 2014, AISTATS]

Recent research (on the ArXiv):

- "Variational Inference: A Review for Statisticians" (with J. McAuliffe and A. Kucukelbir)
- "Hierarchical Variational Models" (with R. Ranganath and D. Tran)
- "Automatic Differentiation Variational Inference" (with A. Kucukelbir, D. Tran, R. Ranganath, and A. Gelman)

Open and current research:

- How can we improve the gradient estimator in BBVI?
- Can we use alternative divergence measures? What are their properties?
- What are the statistical properties of VI? What is a good framework?
- How can we efficiently go beyond the mean field?



#### Should I be skeptical about variational inference?



# MCMC enjoys theoretical guarantees.

- But they usually get to the same place. [Kucukelbir et al., submitted]
- We need more theory about variational inference.

#### Should I be skeptical about variational inference?



- Variational inference underestimates the variance of the posterior.
- Relaxing the mean-field assumption can help.
- Here: A Poisson GLM [Giordano et al., 2015]